CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JULY 26, 2012 202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:15PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Absent
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Absent

Boardmember Maria Curry Present arrived at 1:25PM

BoardmemberTom LarimerPresentBoardmemberEvelya RiveraPresentBoardmemberAbel SilvasPresentBoardmemberAnn WoodsPresent

Staff to the Board in Attendance Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary

Cathy Winterrowd, Principal Planner

Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner Jodie Brown, Senior Planner Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner Camille Pekarek, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Keith Bauerle, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR May 24, 2012 and June 28, 2012

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE MAY 24, 2012 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas Vote: 7-0-1 Motion Passes

(Baksh)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE JUNE 28, 2012 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone Vote: 7-0-1 Motion Passes

(Woods)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

ABSENCES

Boardmembers Bethke and Lemmo notified staff they would not be in attendance. Boardmember Marrone has to leave at 3:00PM.

OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION

✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

None

• EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- I would like to introduce Planning Intern Camille Pekarek, recent graduate of SDSU with a BA in Art History. We are very pleased to have Camille as part of the historic preservation section and anticipate keeping her very busy for the next year.
- There will be no HRB Meeting in August, as the 12th floor meeting room will be closed for remodeling during that month. The next regularly scheduled HRB meeting will be on Thursday, September 27, 2012 at 1:00 PM.
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, August 1, 2012. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, August 13, 2012. There will be no Policy Subcommittee meeting in July. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, August 13, 2012.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 3 referrals from Development Services and 4 individual homeowner nominations, of which three have been continued from previous agendas. There are 12 homeowner nominations in 2012 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation. We anticipate bringing all these nominations to the Board during this calendar year.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

La Jolla Historical Society requested a continuance for Item 8 – Lillian Lentell Cottages; Applicant is opposed to a continuance

Board declined to make a motion to grant a continuance.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 9 - AUGUST AND ELLEN ROSS HOUSE

ITEM 10 - HELEN RUTH DAILEY/RUSSELL FORESTER HOUSE

ITEM 11 – LUIGI AND LOUISE PERNA/ FRANK HOPE, SR. HOUSE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER RIVERA TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 9, 10, AND 11 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFFS RECOMMENDATION WITH A MODIFICATION TO THE RESOLUTION FOR ITEM 10

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone Vote: 9-0-0 Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – ANNIE PORTER HOUSE

Continued from April 2012

Applicant: Bankers Hill Property LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2126-30 Front Street, 92101, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1289 1-A)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 2126-30 Front Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Annie Porter House located at 2126-30 Front Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1895 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear additions consisting of an approx 144 square feet one story addition constructed c. 1921 with an approx 144 square feet second story addition above constructed at an unknown date.

Report Number: HRB-12-008

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Bruce Coons

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian (Allen DiDonato, Tolga Horoz)

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge stated that the 1895 period of significance is documented, Victorian-era is period of architecture not architectural style. Transitional period has character defining features of the Queen Anne style of the Victorian period of architecture. She supports Staff's recommendation with addition of "late Victorian period of architecture" to the resolution.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of July 26, 2012 Page 4 of 8

Boardmember Marrone is also in favor of Staff's recommendation with change to the resolution. It is intact and could be restored.

Boardmember Larimer agrees with Boardmember Berge. Thinks it is a beautiful home, it may not be in the best condition but it is certainly recognizable; it would be a shame to lose it. He supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Curry agrees with Staff recommendation. HRB looks at historical elements of this structure, not a project or economic feasibility. Need various examples to tell whole story.

Boardmember Silvas asked what grant programs were available.

Boardmember Woods agrees with the other speakers, the alterations are minimal and it is a beautiful home.

Boardmember Baksh was on the fence, now supports Staff's recommendation for designation.

Boardmember Rivera was also on the fence but it's now very clear it is significant and supports designation.

Vice-Chair Garbini is in favor of designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – ANNIE PORTER HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH ONE MINOR INSERT IN THE RESOLUTION AFTER QUEEN ANNE STYLE INSERT LATE VICTORIAN PERIOD OF ARCHITECTURE

Seconded by Boardmember Marrone Vote: 9-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 6 – FRED W. OSBURN HOUSE

Continued from May 2012

Applicant: NDD, Inc. represented by Marie Burke Lia

Velda Knox, property owner

<u>Location</u>: 2430 Union Street, 92101, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1288 1-J)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 2430 Union Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Fred W. Osburn House located at 2430 Union Street as a

historical resource with a period of significance of c.1888 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-12-031 and Staff memo dated July 12, 2012

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Soheil Nakishab

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry supports designation under Criterion C.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of July 26, 2012 Page 5 of 8

Boardmember Larimer supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone also supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Berge agrees with Staff and supports designation under Criterion C.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation

Boardmember Silvas supports Staff's recommendation

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – FRED W. OSBURN HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Curry Vote: 8-1-0 Motion Passes

(Rivera)

ITEM 7 – 2823 JUNIPER STREET

Continued from April 2012

Applicant: Christina and Thomas Roemer represented by Scott A. Moomjian

<u>Location</u>: 2823 Juniper Street, 92104, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 1-D**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 2823 Juniper Street as a historical resource

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property located at 2823 Juniper Street under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-12-025

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Kim Grant

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Silvas likes the house.

Boardmember Woods thinks it is a beautiful house, but all of the alterations put together are significant. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh is not concerned that it was moved, he is concerned with all of the modifications. He thinks it lacks integrity, supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Rivera had a question about the original siding.

Boardmember Berge asked if the new siding could be removed and then come back to HRB. She has concerns with other modifications.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of July 26, 2012 Page 6 of 8

Boardmember Marrone agrees with Boardmember Berge, doesn't have a problem with it being moved, but there are a lot of changes. She is in favor of requesting the owner come back after the restoration of the siding.

Boardmember Larimer asked if the designation could be conditional.

Boardmember Curry mentioned that there is no guarantee of designation even if the owner restores the siding. Movement of the building is associated with social history and is very interesting.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports Staff's recommendation; enclosed porch has changed balance to front view.

Boardmember Berge asked if it can be sent back for restoration.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO GRANT AN INDEFINITE CONTINUANCE FOR ITEM 7 – 2823 JUNIPER STREET

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera Vote: 9-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – LILLIAN LENTELL COTTAGES

Applicant: Maynard and Virginia Sievek Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

<u>Location</u>: 7761 Eads Avenue and 7762 Bishops Lane, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 7-E)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 7761 Eads Avenue and 7762 Bishops Lane as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Lillian Lentell Cottages located at 7761 Eads Avenue and 7762 Bishops Lane as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913-1915 under HRB Criterion A.

Report Number: HRB-12-045

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Constance Branscomb

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Louis Beecham, C.A. Marengo

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Marrone mentioned that they were built as beach cottages in 1913 and 1915 on original lot, similar to Silverado property. She supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer said the village has a very special place in his heart. These homes exemplify early beach cottages in La Jolla; they are intact to original site, valuable to fabric of community. He supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Curry thinks they need to look at Criterion C, style, type, period or method. These are modest examples. They are vernacular expressions of Craftsman style, could consider Criterion C because they have integrity for the way they were designed. They comply with Criterion A contextual history. Can't look at just high style, need these to understand the others.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of July 26, 2012 Page 7 of 8

Boardmember Rivera mentioned that there are only 36 cottages left; need to preserve those that are left, could be one of the last in our history. She was on the fence based on the current land uses in the neighborhood, supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports designation.

Boardmember Silvas mentioned that the home is almost a hundred years old.

Boardmember Berge thinks the Bishops property may look like a beach cottage, the later one does not fit theme. Earlier surveys did not identify these cottages. She does not support designation under Criterion A for beach cottage theme.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports designation under Criterion A, there are still quite of number of small scale cottages on block; workers cottages are still along alley.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – LILLIAN LENTELL COTTAGES PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods Vote: 8-1-0 Motion Passes

(Berge)

ITEM 9 – AUGUST AND ELLEN ROSS HOUSE

Applicant: Bonnie Ingalls and Cydna Swan represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 4010 Wesleyan Place, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 3 (1269 2-G)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4010 Wesleyan Place as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the August and Ellen Ross House located at 4010 Wesleyan Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1955 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-12-042

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 10 - HELEN RUTH DAILEY/RUSSELL FORESTER HOUSE

Applicant: Michael M. Mullin Family Trust c/o Connie Mullin Branscomb

Location: 7750 Ludington Place, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-G)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 7750 Ludington Place as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Helen Ruth Dailey/Russell Forester House located at 7750 Ludington Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1949 under HRB Criteria C and D. The 324 square foot addition constructed in 1962 and the 75 square foot addition constructed in 1997 are excluded from the proposed designation.

Report Number: HRB-12-043

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA WITH MODIFICATION TO RESOLUTION

Historical Resources Board Minutes of July 26, 2012 Page 8 of 8

ITEM 11 – LUIGI AND LOUISE PERNA/ FRANK HOPE, SR. HOUSE

Applicant: Slawomir Niewiadomski represented by Scott A. Moomjian

<u>Location</u>: 2320 Hickory Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 2320 Hickory Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Luigi and Louise Perna/ Frank Hope, Sr. House located at 2320 Hickory Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB-12-044

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT AGENDA

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, September 27, 2012

LOCATION: City Administration Building

12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:25PM